

Analyzing the Comparison and Integration of the Holistic Education Approach with Liberal, Specialized, and Quality Educational Modes

Zhao Yanmei^{1,2}, Mohd Mokhtar Muhamad¹, Siti Salina Mustakim¹, Li Wenling¹, Wu Xuanyi³

¹Faculty of Educational Studies, University Putra Malaysia, Selangor, Malaysia,

²School of Foreign Languages, Yuxi Normal University, Yuxi, China, ³Faculty of Modern

Languages and Communication, University Putra Malaysia, Selangor, Malaysia

Corresponding Author Email: mk_mokhtar@upm.edu.my

To Link this Article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJAREMS/v12-i4/19778> DOI:10.6007/IJAREMS/v12-i4/19778

Published Online: 09 December 2023

Abstract

In the current fast-changing educational environment, understanding and effectively integrating different modes of education is crucial for developing students with diverse abilities. This research investigates integrating liberal, specialized, and quality education to foster holistic student development, addressing a research gap in this field. Holistic education has gained widespread attention in academic and practical areas as the education field continues exploring talent development models. Based on holistic education, this study compares and analyses the three primary modes of general education, professional education, and quality education. It explores their core points, practical strategies, and effectiveness in fostering students' all-round development. By combining literature review and comparative analysis, the study aims to gain a deeper understanding of the characteristics and interactions of each educational model and how to synthesize these models to achieve the best results in education. The study reveals that although each model has distinctive features and strengths, integrating the three educational approaches can create a richer and more balanced learning environment for students. The paper also highlights the challenges and limitations in practical application and provides directions for future research. Overall, the study offers valuable theoretical references and strategic recommendations for educational practitioners to guide them in integrating and applying various educational modalities in real-life teaching and learning. The main contribution of the study is that it provides a new perspective to assess and combine the strengths of different educational models, offers practical strategic recommendations for educational practitioners and policymakers, enhances the understanding of the holistic concept of education, and provides theoretical and empirical support for achieving more effective educational practices.

Keywords: Holistic Education, Liberal Education, Specialized Education, Quality Education

Introduction

In recent years, with the diversification of the education system and the changing needs of society for talent training, holistic education has received increasing attention. It goes beyond the traditional training in subject knowledge and aims to develop students' holistic competencies. Beyond academics, holistic education is essential for the holistic growth of students, the peaceful advancement of society, and the country's competitiveness in the future. In a more technologically evolved and globally interconnected world, we need citizens who can think critically, solve problems independently, and feel deeply about their civic responsibilities (Miller, 2007).

Past researchers have preliminarily explored holistic education, such as its origins, philosophy, and implementation strategies. However, the links and differences with liberal, specialized, and quality education have not been thoroughly examined. There is still controversy about holistic education's specific definition, characteristics, and links with other educational modes (Miller, 2007; Forbes, 2003). This study aims to fill this gap and provide educators, policymakers, and researchers with comprehensive and systematic analyses and recommendations. This study will first explore the core research questions of holistic education, i.e., its linkages and differences with other educational modes. Then, we will describe in detail the historical background, core concepts, and implementation strategies of holistic education (Mahmoudi et al., 2012). Based on the literature analysis and comparative study, we will delve into the characteristics and strengths of holistic education and conduct detailed comparative research of holistic education with the other three modes (Nava, 2001). Ultimately, a conclusion and suggestions will be provided.

Literature Review

As the field of education has evolved, various educational modes have surfaced to respond to the needs of society and the times. This part will delve into the four main educational modes, including holistic education, liberal education, specialized education, and quality education. The section on holistic education extends from its historical origins to core concepts and dimensions (Miller, 2007). While liberal, specialized, and quality educational modes highlight their origins, key features, core concepts, and practical applications (Labaree, 1997; Christodoulou, 2014). This overview aims to provide readers with a clear and systematic perspective on these four educational modes to facilitate more in-depth subsequent analyses and discussions.

Review of Holistic Education

As the concept of education continues to evolve, people's expectations for the growth and development of students gradually go beyond the mere acquisition of knowledge and skills training. The introduction of the holistic education mode marks a more comprehensive and in-depth understanding of education. This approach emphasizes students' moral, emotional, social, and physical growth rather than just academic performance (Forbes, 2003). The following section explores its origins, journey, and importance while digging deeper into its core concepts and elements.

History and Development of Holistic Education

Holistic education can be traced back to the educational philosophy of the ancient Greek period. Educators at that time believed that education should cultivate students' minds, spirits, and bodies to achieve harmony and balance (Miller, 2000). In the Middle Ages,

education was mainly for cultivating religious virtues. By the Renaissance, people began to pay attention to the individual's overall development, believing that education was about learning knowledge and developing human character, aesthetics, and physical health.

Education faced many new challenges and demands with the rapid development of science and technology in society and globalization. People realize simple skills training and knowledge inculcation can no longer meet community needs. As a result, holistic education began to be emphasized and promoted. This educational concept strongly emphasizes the development of student's character, emotions, creativity, and critical thinking in addition to their specialized expertise (Miller, 2007). It states that pupils ought to grow in all areas—academically, morally, socially, and physically (Nava, 2001). The holistic concept of education is widely used at all educational levels due to the increased focus on mental health and emotional education. Many academic institutions and researchers are dedicated to investigating the best ways to incorporate holistic education into teaching practices to help students gain information and skills, as well as a sound personality and optimistic attitude toward life.

Core Concepts and Dimensions of Holistic Education

The core philosophy of holistic education stems from a holistic and multidimensional understanding of the human being. It advocates that education develops students' academic competence and moulds their personality and abilities (Mahmoudi et al., 2012). Under this philosophy, students are no longer seen as passive recipients of knowledge but as active learners and practitioners who grow and develop in multiple dimensions, including moral, emotional, social, and physical, along with acquiring academic knowledge (Nava, 2001).

Holistic education emphasizes the moral growth of the person. It holds that morality is a profound understanding and respect for the world and other people rather than a collection of laws or a code of behaviour (Miller, 2000). Students who receive a comprehensive education are more equipped to think critically, discern right from wrong, and form moral convictions and worldviews. Emotional development is given great importance in holistic education. In the learning process, students should learn how to deal with their emotions, establish harmonious relationships with others, and face challenges and pressure (Dahlin, 2017).

Holistic education also emphasizes the development of social skills. It is not only to help students build good relationships with others but also to help them communicate and cooperate better with others in their future life and work (Mahmoudi et al., 2012). Physical health and growth are also of concern to holistic education. A healthy body is the cornerstone of learning and living. Therefore, holistic education also focuses on physical exercise and health education.

Review of Liberal Education

Throughout history, liberal education has played a crucial role in shaping the educational landscape by fostering in students a broad variety of knowledge and integrative qualities. Its objective is to assist students in bridging disciplinary barriers and enhancing their moral responsibility, communication abilities, and critical thinking to better prepare them for vocations and society (Roche, 2010). With time, liberal education has been widely promoted in the Western world and has received increasing global attention.

Origin and Importance of Liberal Education

The origins of liberal education can be found in the educational systems of ancient Greece and Rome, where the goal was to prepare pupils for lives as well-read and cultured citizens by offering a broad and well-balanced curriculum (Kimball, 1986). Education is not only for professional preparation but also for developing moral awareness and philosophical thinking in citizens. Liberal arts education, or the combined study of science, philosophy, literature, and history, maintained a top emphasis for European colleges during much of the Middle Ages and the Renaissance.

The concept of a liberal education persisted even as specialization and vocationalization became increasingly important in school due to the refinement of knowledge and discipline. It nevertheless plays a part in many countries' higher education systems since it is acknowledged that a single, specialized talent is far from enough to handle today's rapidly evolving modern society's concerns (Baker & Baldwin, 2014; Roth, 2015). Developing critical thinking, transdisciplinary learning abilities, and a global perspective are the three main benefits of a liberal education. These three talents are increasingly crucial in 21st-century cultures (Nussbaum, 2016).

Core Idea, Characteristics, and Implementation of Liberal Education

The core idea behind liberal education is to provide students with a broad academic foundation that allows them to confront various perspectives and develop (Kagan, 2019). In contrast to specialized education, Liberal education does not merely focus on knowledge and skills in a particular field. However, it encourages students to explore various disciplines for a more holistic educational experience (Roche, 2013).

A distinctive feature of liberal education is its interdisciplinary nature. Students are no longer confined to their significant disciplines. People can select programs in other subjects like literature, the arts, social sciences, and natural sciences to improve their ability to learn across disciplines. This educational approach also strongly emphasizes students' moral growth, social responsibility, and global awareness—all crucial in today's diverse and globalized world.

Educational institutions must provide suitable curricula and teaching strategies to implement liberal education. Schools usually offer a variety of obligatory and elective courses on many topics so that students can choose what best suits their requirements and interests. Schools typically provide a wide range of required and elective courses in numerous subjects so that students can select the ones that best fit their needs and interests (Zakaria, 2015). Additionally, to promote communication and collaboration between teachers and students, schools may provide a range of seminar series, debate forums, and hands-on activities. To foster students' independent thought and creativity, a focus on group discussions, reflection, and exploratory learning is made in terms of instructional methodologies.

Review of Specialized Education

Specialized education, a technique intended to give pupils in-depth information and skills in a particular sector, has become vital to advancement today. Unlike other educational programs, the main goals of specialized education are to assist students in becoming more competent in the real world and prepare them for specific careers (Wheelahan, 2015).

The History of Specialized Education and Its Significance

Specialized education is a central component of the development of human society. In early agricultural communities, craftsmen and artisans passed on their skills to the next generation

through the master-apprentice system. With the advent of industrialization and the growing demand for specific skills and knowledge, the education system began prioritizing specialized education, thus gradually forming a more systematic specialized training mechanism (Brewer, 2011). Specialized education is more than just vocational skills training in the traditional sense; its role in contemporary society goes far beyond that (Jenkins, 2009). In the fast-developing modern society, specialized education provides individuals with a broader range of employment opportunities and meets society's demand for specialists in specific fields (Hanushek et al., 2017). For students, specialized education means they can acquire more in-depth knowledge and skills training according to their interests and career plans (Jarvis, 2018). More importantly, specialized education brings stability and predictability to society. It guarantees that top experts in vital fields like science, engineering, and medicine can deliver excellent services and resolve challenging issues. Due to international rivalry through globalization, a nation's ability to innovate and remain competitive is strongly correlated with the calibre and scope of its specialized education.

Core Objectives and Methods of Specialized Education

Students pursuing specialized education have long been equipped with the information and abilities to succeed in each sector or industry. Its main goal is to help students prepare for the workforce and strengthen their lifelong learning and adaptation capacity in a changing workplace (Ahmad, 2020). In addition, fostering students' critical thinking, sense of innovation, and teamwork are integral parts of specialized education as these are essential qualities in the modern workplace (Cobo, 2013).

Regarding methodology, specialized education emphasizes the combination of practice and theory. Students can better apply their knowledge to real-life situations through experiments, projects, and practical activities that simulate the working environment (Duncan et al., 2012). Meanwhile, to ensure that the content of education keeps pace with the development of the industry, many educational institutions have established close partnerships with enterprises to obtain real-time information on industry dynamics and needs (Mikkonen et al., 2018). Rapid technological advances have also provided new tools and methods for specialized education. Innovative modes such as online programs, virtual laboratories, and remote internships allow students to acquire knowledge and skills more flexibly, regardless of time and place.

Specialized education aims to provide students with in-depth and comprehensive professional knowledge and skills while focusing on developing the general qualities they need in the workplace. To achieve this, educational institutions adopt various innovative and practical approaches to ensure students can integrate successfully and contribute to society.

Review of Quality Education

The review of quality education highlights its origins, importance, and core concepts and applications. It provides an opportunity to gain a deeper understanding of the context and principles of quality education. A fuller account of its evolution and development can be achieved by exploring quality education's historical origins and philosophical underpinnings (Zhang, 2022). This understanding will help better compare and integrate quality education with other educational modes, thus better addressing today's complex and changing academic challenges.

Origin and Importance of Quality Education

Ancient educators understood that education should focus on developing a person's skills in various areas, including morality, emotion, aesthetics, and physical health, rather than only teaching facts (Tam, 2009). As science and technology have advanced and the economy has grown, people's demands and expectations for education have evolved significantly throughout history, particularly in modern society. Community needs individuals not only to master professional skills but also expects them to develop in an all-round way and possess comprehensive qualities that are in step with the times (Chen & Chen, 2021).

Against this background, quality education has emerged, which emphasizes cultivating students' autonomy, creativity, and critical thinking and is no longer confined to a single mastery of knowledge (Lam et al., 2021). Its emergence is precisely to meet modern society's diversified and personalized needs for talent training. The importance of quality education is not only reflected in the fact that it can help students develop in an all-round way. More crucially, it helps to cultivate students' ability to live and social adaptability so that they can positively face challenges, solve problems, and realize the value of their lives in a complex and changing social environment.

Core Concepts and Applications of Quality Education

The core concept of quality education emphasizes the full respect and development of each student's uniqueness, personality, and potential (Zhao, 2022). It no longer takes a single test score as the evaluation criterion. However, it focuses on cultivating students' multi-faceted abilities, such as moral qualities, aesthetic sensibilities, social skills, and emotional health. It pursues the development of the holistic of the student, hoping that each student can make the most of their areas of expertise and interest.

In practical application, quality education has changed the traditional teaching methods and evaluation system. Classroom teaching is no longer one-way knowledge instillation but focuses on guiding students to learn, explore, and practice independently. The role of teachers has also changed from traditional lecturers to guides" and collaborators. Extracurricular activities, practical teaching, and community service are also necessary for quality education, providing students with more prosperous and varied learning experiences (Zhao, 2022).

III. Research Methods

The correctness and dependability of study findings are closely correlated with a methodologically sound decision. Appropriate research methodologies are essential in education because of the complexity and interdisciplinarity of the contents involved. This section provides a detailed description and explanation of the primary techniques employed in this investigation. These techniques guarantee the study's impartiality and objectivity and aid in the methodical collection and analysis of data. Each methodology has its specific context and application conditions, and they share the common goal of providing a deeper and more comprehensive understanding of the similarities and differences between holistic education and other educational modes.

Description of Literature Analysis Method

Literature analysis aims to systematically review and interpret existing literature to gain an in-depth understanding of a particular topic or issue. This study's literature analysis was

conducted to understand better the relationships and differences between holistic education and other educational modes (Jesson et al., 2011).

The steps involved in conducting a literature analysis include identifying the problem or purpose of the study, collecting relevant literature, assessing and screening the literature, analyzing the information and summarising and interpreting the results found. After identifying the research problem, the researchers collected much literature on educational modes through academic databases, libraries, and academic journals. Subsequently, an initial literature review was used to filter out the most relevant information to the research topic. In this process, the researcher paid particular attention to literature that explored, analyzed, or evaluated educational modes in depth. When studying literature, the focus was on extracting the core ideas, theoretical frameworks, research methodologies, and critical findings from the literature to compare and integrate different educational modes.

Contrastive Analysis Methods

Contrastive analysis reveals similarities and differences by systematically comparing two or more objects, events, or concepts. This method aims to understand better, explain, and evaluate the object under study through comparison (Nordquist, 2021). This study's comparative analysis will provide insight into the relationships and characteristics between holistic education, liberal education, specialized education, and quality education.

The main reason for choosing comparative analysis as a research methodology is that it can provide a clear, systematic, and in-depth perspective that can help better understand and evaluate different educational modes. Comparative analysis can also reveal the strengths and weaknesses among the various methods, providing vital support and recommendations for educational practice and policy formulation. The advantage of this approach is that it promotes in-depth thinking and reflection, helping researchers and educators to find more appropriate and effective educational techniques and strategies.

Literature Selection

It is imperative to ensure that the literature chosen is exceptionally relevant to the study's goals and queries when choosing and organizing it (Hart, 2018). First, we employed several procedures to ascertain the relevance of the literature to the research. The primary literature sources were major academic search platforms such as Google Scholar, Baidu Scholar, and CNKI. The keywords "holistic education," "liberal education," "specialized education," and "quality education" were used to search.

After acquiring a substantial quantity of early search results, these papers' abstracts and keywords were carefully examined to ascertain their applicability to the research question (Jesson et al., 2011). Considering the quality and reliability of the literature, the researcher purposely chose literature published in quality academic journals or written by renowned scholars in the past ten years to ensure the timeliness of the study.

IV. Analysis and Discussion

This part explores and analyses the similarities, differences, and relationships between holistic education and other modes from multiple perspectives. The strengths and characteristics of various educational philosophies and how they affect students' holistic development can be seen more clearly through comparisons and analyses. At the same time, the integration strategies and possible challenges will also provide essential references for the future direction of education. The discussion section provides valuable insights for educational practitioners and researchers.

Holistic Education and Liberal Education

In addition to core concepts and techniques, liberal education encompasses literature, philosophy, history, art, and ethics (Wang, 2017). These elements foster students' moral and humanistic literacy, expand their capacity for thought and comprehension, and emphasize the breadth and continuity of their skill set. The idea and implementation of liberal education originated in the United States, and its philosophical foundations can be found in Aristotle's liberal education (Bailey, 2010). The heritage of liberal and humanistic traditions is the fundamental component of liberal education, synonymous with liberal education. The aim of liberal education, which originated in the century, is to train students to think independently and be aware of different disciplines to integrate additional knowledge, aiming to produce a complete and integral human being (Rhoten et al., 2006). It is an education that imparts knowledge and skills in all areas of human life. This education offers knowledge and skills relevant to every aspect of human existence. It is an education that is non-specialized, non-vocational, non-utilitarian, civilized, and encompasses all facets of human nature. It produces people with a high degree of understanding, a liberal spirit, beautiful emotion, and a thorough vision. To put it briefly, a comprehensive and methodical knowledge framework and an awareness of all sorts of knowledge are the goals of general education.

The core of holistic education is to cultivate the complete development of human beings to achieve harmony between human beings and themselves, human beings and society, and human beings and nature, and to advocate the construction of relationships between knowledge to gain a correct understanding of society, life, and thus the complete development of human beings (Mehrotra, 2017). The value of holistic education is fully reflected in the forging of a sound personality through holistic knowledge. Researchers believe holistic education is one in which general knowledge, morality, and character are harmonized. The first is moral education, i.e., how to be a human. The second is liberal education, which imparts a wide range of knowledge. Thirdly, it is education for the harmonious development of the mind to form a sound personality. Liberal education is an efficient means to get a holistic education, while holistic education serves as the goal of liberal education. Together, holistic and liberal education can be seen as the link between the objective and the means. Without the backing of liberal education, realizing holistic education may become a rhetorical or meaningless dream. Without the supervision of holistic education, liberal education may become a pile of information or a classification of disciplines. However, an over-emphasis on liberal education will only produce marginalized people in humanities, not science and technology.

Therefore, liberal education and holistic education are complementary and mutually reinforcing. Liberal arts education provides diverse subject knowledge and learning opportunities for holistic education, enriching students' mindset and knowledge base and laying the foundation for their all-round development. On the other hand, holistic education gives meaning and value to general education, enabling its knowledge content to be linked to student's life experiences, emotional experiences, and life goals so that knowledge can be internalized and applied.

Holistic Education and Specialized Education

Specialized education is linked to the development of social productivity, and specialization belongs to the category of sociology, which is an education that prepares students for the competencies required for a specific occupation in the future (Wei, 2018). Specialized education aims to train people who are adapted to the needs of a particular specialized field

and provides a qualification for people to be employed. Specialized education directly serves social employment, and receiving specialized education and choosing and acquiring a highly professional occupation is a means for the educated to achieve class advancement (Zhang, 2017). The institutions that implement specialized education in China include general higher education schools, higher vocational schools, secondary specialized schools, technical schools, and refresher courses and training courses. The requirements for specialized education are that practitioners have the necessary professional learning background for practice and that the conditions of operation, curriculum design, teaching process, and quality of education of the granting school and the specialized field of study meet specific standards. Only in this way can so-called professionally educated specialists be produced. Specialized education is designed to make specialists who are adapted to the needs of a particular field of specialization and to provide a kind of employment guideline for people entering the workforce.

For this reason, many value the relationship between what they study and their professional work and favour specialized education. It is reasonable and necessary for universities to provide specialized education for students following the disciplines and the division of labour in society as the leading providers of talented people to the community. However, an excessively narrow specialized education produces only hollow people who know only science and technology but not the humanities.

The essential difference between holistic and professional education lies in the distinction between holistic and specialized. Stebbins (2017) suggests that for a person to be fully competent and enjoy the joy of work to the fullest, they should know all aspects of the sociological, historical, psychological, and literary-based arts of work. Simultaneously, an intelligent individual can make a living and survive (Thomas & Inkson, 2017). Not only should one be ready for work, but also for how work is changing. He believed that general and specialized education must go hand in hand, fully embodying the idea of education of the holistic person at the university.

Thus, holistic and specialized education are mutually reinforcing and interdependent. While holistic education provides students with a foundation for holistic development and equips them to adapt to the requirements of different environments and professions, specialized education provides students with the professional knowledge and skills to be competitive in their specific fields. Realizing the limitations of over-specialization in university education, educationalists have developed the idea of the formation of the holistic person and have begun to emphasize the integration of general and specialized education. The combination of the two enables the training of people with comprehensive literacy and professional competence, better suited to the development needs of society.

Holistic Education and Quality Education

The essential connotation of quality education is to improve the comprehensive quality of the educated. Specifically, quality education educates the educated in various aspects, such as science and culture, labour technology, ideology and morality, psychological quality, and business quality (Dello-Iacovo, 2009). Quality education mainly includes inner-quality education and outer-quality education. A person's perspective on life, society, and the wider world—which encompasses their viewpoint, worldview, and values—is considered their intrinsic character (Margalit & Raz, 2022). It is often referred to as a person's type of mentality. Education aims to achieve harmonious and holistic development in the educated person's moral, intellectual, physical, and aesthetic aspects.

Quality education and holistic education are opposites. They are fundamentally the same in that quality education also focuses on promoting the comprehensive development of human beings and improving their quality. The distinction between the two is that high-quality education emphasizes the subject matter and mode of instruction rather than the narrow objectives of exam-centric learning and higher graduation rates. Conversely, holistic education emphasizes the result and method of teaching. At the same time, its counterpart is the one-sided pursuit of technical skills and specialized education. Wang (2007) accurately interprets the relationship between holistic and quality education. She argues that holistic education is a higher, more intrinsic, and more profound concept than quality education. It's an avant-garde, idealistic approach to schooling. More precisely, holistic education aims to create the best possible human condition, life, and society by educating the whole person through general education and comprehensive, high-quality education.

Holistic education and high-quality education are complementary and aid in the general development of students. Holistic education provides the philosophy and framework that guides and supports the implementation of quality education. Quality education, on the other hand, is the concrete practice of holistic education, which achieves the goal of holistic education by developing the qualities and abilities of students.

Integration Strategies and Challenges

Integrating educational modes has become a trend to adapt to changing social needs and educational goals. Different modes have their unique strengths and values. The current challenge for educators and researchers is how to combine them skillfully to bring out their respective strengths and complement each other. In this context, the integration strategies of holistic education with the three different educational modes and their challenges are of particular interest.

Motivation and Background for Integration

Various modes of education have emerged to meet the needs of the times and pursue the individual's holistic growth. Holistic education focuses on cultivating students' abilities and has received widespread attention. However, it is difficult for a single education mode to meet the increasingly complex social and vocational needs. It means that while maintaining the characteristics of the original education mode, it is essential to explore integration with other methods.

Liberal education, specialized education, and quality education have unique positioning and advantages. Liberal education emphasizes a broad body of knowledge and interdisciplinary learning. On the other hand, specialized education focuses on in-depth training in specific fields. Quality education pays much attention to individuals' character and emotional development. Integrating these three modes with holistic education makes education more comprehensive and provides students with a richer and more balanced learning experience. The demand for talent in today's society is becoming increasingly diversified and comprehensive. Enterprises and organizations are no longer satisfied with recruiting specialists with a single skill or knowledge but are more interested in total quality and cross-boundary capabilities. Against this backdrop, the integration of education has become a trend and is necessary to ensure that trained talents can adapt and cope with future challenges.

Forms and Modes of Integration

In pursuing a comprehensive and balanced educational experience, integrating different educational modes has become a necessary strategy. This integration is not simply a matter of superimposing the characteristics of each method but rather a search for synergy in complementarity to create a learning environment that is more beneficial to students.

Curriculum structure has always been central to education reform, reflecting educators' educational philosophy and determining students' learning paths. In traditional education, curricula are often designed according to the boundaries of disciplines and specializations. While this fixed division provides students with a clear direction for learning, it also limits their room for choice and opportunities for interdisciplinary learning. However, with the rapid development of society and diversified needs, people have begun to recognize that a single, closed curriculum structure can no longer meet the needs of modern education. As a result, an integrative curriculum structure came into being. Strict disciplinary or professional boundaries in this new structure no longer bind students. However, they can choose, mix, and match general, specialized, and quality education according to their interests and career plans. Such flexibility enables students to acquire more comprehensive and diversified knowledge and promotes innovative thinking, interdisciplinary communication, and cooperation.

Moreover, this integrated curriculum structure emphasizes accumulating knowledge and cultivating students' comprehensive quality and critical thinking. Students can better understand the intrinsic connection between various disciplines through interdisciplinary learning, thus forming a complete worldview and methodology. At the same time, a rich humanistic culture helps them to understand themselves and society more deeply and to develop modern citizens with a truly international outlook and a sense of social responsibility. The transformation of teaching methods reflects the modern concept of education. In traditional education, students have few opportunities to participate in in-depth inquiry because most instruction is lecture-based and teacher-centered. Nonetheless, as educational theory has been revitalized, many academics and educators have realized that authentic learning involves imparting knowledge and fostering students' curiosity, critical thinking, and problem-solving abilities. As a result, hands-on and inquiry-based teaching methods are gradually being emphasized. Students are urged to participate in various real-world initiatives, like fieldwork, community service, and experimental research, as this helps them apply what they have learned and improves their teamwork and communication abilities. Discussions and debates in the classroom also allow students to practice and showcase their critical thinking abilities. Modern technology also plays an integral role in updating teaching methods. Students can learn at any time and from any location thanks to online learning systems like MOOCs, which dissolve time and location barriers. On the other hand, realistic and secure laboratory environments are offered to students through virtual labs, simulation software, and augmented reality, which aids in their understanding of challenging ideas and concepts.

Changes in assessment methods are not only a reflection of student learning outcomes from multiple perspectives but also a reorientation of educational values and goals. In traditional education, examination results are often seen as the sole or primary measure of student ability. However, this evaluation might not adequately represent students' talents, particularly their capacity for creative problem-solving, effective communication, and collaborative work. Through project-based assessment, students can use their newly acquired knowledge and abilities to tackle specific challenges in a simulated or real-world setting. It

improves students' comprehension of the course material and fosters their capacity for autonomous thought and problem-solving. In project assessment, students' performance depends on their knowledge base and, more importantly, on how they apply it to solve practical problems. Teamwork assessment, on the other hand, emphasizes students' social interaction and collaboration skills. In such an assessment, students are required to cooperate with others to complete a task or project. It hones their communication and collaboration skills and develops their leadership and teamwork. Practical experience assessment, such as internships, field trips, or community service, emphasizes students' practical skills and sense of social responsibility. These assessment forms require students to apply what they have learned in a natural work environment, developing their adaptability and ability to solve practical problems.

As education reflects deeply on assessment methods, we realize that measuring students' abilities and potential requires more comprehensive and diversified assessment methods. Only in this way can we ensure that education truly fulfils the purpose for which it was designed to produce well-rounded individuals well adapted to the needs of the future society.

Potential Challenges and Solutions

Challenge 1: Resource Allocation and Optimization and Programs: Integrated Planning and Rational Allocation

Resource allocation and optimization become the primary challenge in integrating holistic education with other modes. When different education modes are intertwined, there is likely to be overlapping and wastage of resources, duplication of similar curriculum content, teaching materials, or unused teaching equipment. Educational institutions may be under pressure to invest heavily while at the same time ensuring that these resources are used efficiently and not wasted to meet diversified teaching and learning needs.

Facing this situation, integrated planning and rationalization are crucial. Schools and educational institutions must understand the demand for and use of various resources and carry out scientific resource planning in light of students' learning needs and objectives. Therefore, it is necessary not only to analyze the existing use of resources but also to forecast the future trend of education and students' needs to ensure a continuous supply and updating of resources. In addition, through technological means, such as data analysis and resource management systems, the flow and distribution of resources can be more accurately grasped to maximize the use of resources and reduce wastage.

Challenge II: Teacher Training and Updating Programs: Continuous Teacher Training and Development

Another notable challenge in integrating educational modes is teacher training and renewal. Integrating holistic education with other forms of education requires teachers to possess specialized knowledge, interdisciplinary teaching skills, and mastery of modern pedagogical methods, which places higher demands on teachers. Teachers may face confusion about how to effectively integrate different modes of education, how to achieve proper integration in the classroom, and how to assess and provide feedback on students' overall progress.

Continuous teacher training and development is vital to address this challenge. First, schools and educational institutions should establish a long-term and systematic teacher training program to ensure teachers can keep abreast of and master new teaching methods and concepts. It includes not only the updating of educational technology but also such elements as educational psychology, student development theories, and interdisciplinary teaching methods. Secondly, encouraging exchanges and cooperation among teachers can help them

share best practices and learn from each other. In addition, providing teachers with practical opportunities, such as participating in pilot projects or research studies, can help them better integrate theory and practice and continuously improve their teaching effectiveness.

Challenge 3: Student Adaptation and Solution: Orientation and Counselling

Student adaptation becomes a challenge that cannot be ignored. The new integrated teaching mode requires students to not only acquire knowledge but also to be able to think across disciplines, learn actively, and reflect deeply. For students who are used to traditional teaching methods, this change may cause confusion and uneasiness, and they may find it challenging to keep up with the pace or not understand the learning objectives and requirements of the new mode.

To meet this challenge, guidance and counselling become vital strategies. Firstly, educators should communicate the new learning concepts and objectives to help students understand the meaning and value of this integration and its importance to their personal growth and future career development. Secondly, orientation activities and workshops should be conducted to gradually familiarise students with the new learning methods and techniques. These activities may include group discussions, simulation exercises, and case studies. It is also essential to provide personalized counselling services. As each student's background, abilities, and needs are unique, a dedicated counsellor or team must provide them with one-to-one guidance and assistance to ensure that they can successfully adapt and grow in the new educational environment. It will help students overcome their learning difficulties and enhance their confidence and motivation in further education.

Challenge 4: Harmonization and Fairness of Assessment Criteria and Solution: Development of a Harmonized Assessment System

Harmonization and fairness of assessment standards is undoubtedly a complex topic. There are often significant differences in the focus and assessment methods across different education modes. When these modes begin to converge, the main issue for educators and administrators is ensuring that assessment systems can comprehensively reflect student learning outcomes and maintain their fairness.

Developing a unified assessment system is especially critical to address this challenge. This system should be based on evaluating students' overall competence rather than focusing solely on the degree of knowledge acquisition. In addition to traditional written and oral tests, the assessment system should incorporate various assessment methods, such as project evaluation, teamwork, and practical experience, to ensure that students are evaluated comprehensively from different perspectives and dimensions. In addition, to ensure the fairness of the assessment, the marking criteria and evaluation guidelines should be clear, transparent, understandable, and acceptable to all educators involved in the assessment. It may require the organization of several training sessions and workshops so that educators can gain in-depth knowledge and understanding of this unified assessment system. At the same time, this assessment system should be open to adaptation and improvement as practice progresses. By collecting feedback from educators and students and conducting regular checks on the effectiveness of the assessment, it can be ensured that the assessment system is always in sync with the development of the educational objectives and modes, thus better serving the growth and development of students.

Discussion

This section has been dedicated to parsing and unpacking the critical findings of this study, highlighting its central contribution to the field of education and comparing it to existing

academic work. A full appreciation of its limitations and direction for subsequent inquiry is essential.

Deepening Understanding of Findings

The comparison and integration of holistic education with other educational modes has revealed a range of meaningful findings that provide new perspectives on the current educational environment and offer insights into the future direction of education.

The importance of holistic education is increasingly evident in today's changing social environment. In the context of rapid technological advancement and globalization, individuals must possess specialized knowledge and skills and a wide range of humanistic qualities, critical thinking, and interdisciplinary learning abilities. It is precisely the goal pursued by holistic education. By integrating liberal, specialized, and quality education, holistic education aims to develop students' abilities in multiple dimensions and help them meet the challenges of modern society.

Further, although various educational modes have merits, their practical application boundaries are unclear. Many educational practices embody a mixture of multiple ways. It suggests that to cope with the complexity of education, we need to break away from traditional frameworks and innovate educational methods and strategies.

Echoing Each Other in the Literature

The similarities and differences between different studies can be seen through in-depth research and analysis of a wide range of literature. Although various studies offer their perspectives and recommendations on educational modes and approaches, many core concepts are reflected in different literatures, showing a common trend and direction.

The importance of holistic education is highly recognized in most literature. Previous studies generally agree that a single mode of education can no longer meet the needs of students in the face of today's increasingly complex social and specialized environment. It is highly consistent with the viewpoints of this study, further proving the centrality of holistic education. However, when we delve into specific educational strategies and approaches, the differences between the various literatures become more apparent. For example, some studies advocate a more liberal and flexible curriculum, while others emphasize structured and systematic education. These differences may stem from the researchers' backgrounds, cultures, local educational environments, and particular areas of interest and target groups. In contrast to this study, some literature focuses more on the practical dimension of exploring educational integration strategies, providing many concrete cases and experimental data. It provides a valuable reference to help us better understand and apply these strategies.

Limitations of the Study

Every study is undoubtedly accompanied by its specific limitations. These limitations are not always due to external factors such as resources or conditions. Sometimes, they arise due to decisions made in research design and implementation. Recognizing and acknowledging these limitations strengthens the depth of our research knowledge and outlines the direction for further research.

Considering the research methodology, the comparative analyses revealed significant differences between different educational modes, but there may have been omissions. Specific educational methods may excel in certain cultural or social environments, and such subtle adaptations may be elusive in a purely comparative context. The primary data source

is electronic databases such as Google Scholar, Baidu Scholar, and CNKI. Some precious literature not indexed by these platforms may not have been considered. Electronic databases may also have inherent biases, resulting in research from specific places or institutions being over-emphasized or ignored. Despite the researcher's best endeavours to remain neutral and impartial, they are still inevitably influenced by the researcher's background, knowledge, and preferences. There may be an unconscious bias in favour of specific familiar or preferred modes when evaluating various methods.

V. Conclusion and Suggestions

The in-depth discussions and analyses mentioned above show that integrating educational modes is a new trend and great value for developing students with comprehensive abilities. This conclusion is reinforced by comparative analyses, empirical studies, and cross-validation with existing literature. At the same time, however, any change brings challenges that require constant reflection, adaptation, and innovation.

Conclusion

This study has explored integrating holistic education with the other three significant modes of instruction - general education, specialized education, and quality education. It was found that combining these education modes helps provide a more holistic and balanced learning environment for students to acquire in-depth professional knowledge and cultivate a broad perspective and rich humanistic qualities. Even though the integrated education mode has brought about a series of benefits, such as more flexible program structures, more innovative teaching methods, and more comprehensive assessment approaches, there are still a series of challenges in the implementation process. How to allocate and optimize resources effectively, conduct teacher training and updating, and ensure uniformity and fairness in assessment criteria. We also found commonalities and contrasts between this study and earlier research by contrasting and comparing with the body of literature, and we investigated the potential causes of these discrepancies. However, we also acknowledged certain shortcomings in our study, like the selection of research techniques and the issue with data sampling, which offer a path for further investigation in future research.

Implications of the Study

The contribution of this study to theory is mainly in providing a comprehensive analytical framework of holistic education concerning other educational models such as liberal, professional, and quality education. By exploring in depth the interaction of these models and their respective characteristics, this study enhances the understanding of the theory of holistic education, particularly in terms of how it promotes the holistic development of students. In addition, the study's findings provide an essential addition to existing educational theories, especially in exploring how educational models adapt to a rapidly changing global environment. It helps to enrich academic discussions in education and provides new perspectives and paths of reflection for future theory development.

At the practical level, the findings of this study have important guiding significance for educational practitioners and policymakers. By identifying and analyzing the strengths and limitations of different educational models, this study provides educators with strategies for effectively combining these models in their teaching practice. It is essential for designing more comprehensive and innovative teaching programs and curricula. At the same time, this study provides an empirical basis for educational policymaking, especially in promoting the

integration of holistic education and other models. These insights and recommendations can help optimize education policies to better meet students' diverse needs and boost their holistic development.

Suggestions for Future Research

Research on integrating instructional styles and their impacts will become increasingly fruitful and varied as the field of education progresses. Future research could concentrate on the following areas, given the limitations and conclusions of this study.

The diversity of cultures and societies significantly impacts the efficiency and applicability of educational approaches in the context of globalization. Different cultural and social contexts provide unique academic perspectives and challenges, making certain educational modes more effective in specific settings. Therefore, the question of how to achieve the integration of educational methods in different cultural and social contexts and how to identify best practices will be a crucial direction for future research. It will not only help to promote the globalization of education but also provide educators with more relevant and practical strategies and approaches.

The field of education is experiencing revolutionary changes due to technological advances. With the increasing maturity and popularity of various educational technologies, they offer more possibilities and space for different modes of education. How to combine these advanced technological tools with academic methods to better meet student's needs and improve teaching effectiveness and students' learning experience is an important issue facing the education sector today. In the future, an in-depth study of how technology can facilitate the integration and innovation of educational modes will profoundly impact the development of educational practices and strategies.

In education, the success of a mode or strategy is not only reflected in its short-term effects. Its value is better reflected in its long-term sustained impact, especially on students' lifelong learning ability, career, and quality of life. While current research focuses on the immediate benefits of integrated education modes, we must recognize that the real purpose of education is to prepare students for the future. Therefore, future research must concentrate on the problems of identifying best practices and integrating educational modalities in many cultural and socioeconomic situations. It will facilitate the globalization of education while also providing educators access to more modern and practical teaching strategies.

In exploring the integration and practice of education modes, it is essential to pay attention to the voices of other education stakeholders and the needs and feedback of students and educators. Parents, school administrators, community organizations, and businesses influence and participate in the education process to varying degrees. Their views, expectations, and needs on education all provide valuable references for education reform. Therefore, a broader and deeper understanding and incorporation of the views and suggestions of these stakeholders will not only bring richer perspectives to the integration of education modes but also help to ensure that the integrated modes are more practically applicable and socially beneficial.

Integrating educational modes is a complex and ongoing process that requires continuous research and exploration to refine and optimize. Hopefully, this study has provided valuable references in this field and insights and directions for future researchers.

References

- Ahmad, T. (2020). Scenario based approach to re-imagining future of higher education which prepares students for the future of work. *Higher Education, Skills and Work-Based Learning*, 10(1), 217-238.
- Baker, V. L., & Baldwin, R. G. (2014). A Case Study of Liberal Arts Colleges in the 21st Century: Understanding Organizational Change and Evolution in Higher Education. *Innovative Higher Education*, 40(3), 247–261. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10755-014-9311-6>
- Bailey, C. H. (2010). *Beyond the present and the particular: A theory of liberal education* (Vol. 2). Routledge.
- Brewer, E. W. (2011). The history of career and technical education. In *Definitive readings in the history, philosophy, theories and practice of career and technical education* (pp. 1-14). IGI Global.
- Chen, Z., & Chen, Q. (2021). Optimization of teaching evaluation system for football professional teachers based on multievaluation model. *Complexity*, 2021, 1-13.
- Christodoulou, D. (2014). *Seven myths about education*. Routledge.
- Cobo, C. (2013). Skills for innovation: Envisioning an education that prepares for the changing world. *Curriculum Journal*, 24(1), 67-85.
- Dahlin, B. (2017). *Rudolf Steiner: The relevance of waldorf education*. Cham, Switzerland: Springer.
- Dello-Iacovo, B. (2009). Curriculum reform and 'quality education' in China: An overview. *International journal of educational development*, 29(3), 241-249.
- Duncan, I., Miller, A., & Jiang, S. (2012). A taxonomy of virtual worlds usage in education. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 43(6), 949-964.
- Forbes, S.H. (2003). *Holistic education: An analysis of its ideas and nature*. Foundation for Educational Renewal.
- Hanushek, E. A., Schwerdt, G., Woessmann, L., & Zhang, L. (2017). General education, vocational education, and labor-market outcomes over the lifecycle. *Journal of human resources*, 52(1), 48-87.
- Hart, C. (2018). *Doing a literature review: Releasing the research imagination*. SAGE Publications Limited.
- Jarvis, P. (2018). *Professional Education (1983)*. Routledge.
- Jenkins, H. (2009). *Confronting the challenges of participatory culture: Media education for the 21st century* (p. 145). The MIT press.
- Jesson, J., Matheson, L., & Lacey, F. M. (2011). *Doing your literature review: Traditional and systematic techniques*. SAGE.
- Kagan, D. (2019). *What is a Liberal Education?* In Routledge eBooks (pp. 214–225). <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315786858-19>
- Kimball, B. A. (1986). *Orators & Philosophers: A History of the Idea of Liberal Education*. Teachers College Press, 1234 Amsterdam Ave., New York, NY 10027.
- Labaree, D. F. (1997). Public goods, private goods: The American struggle over educational goals. *American Educational Research Journal*, 34(1), 39-81.
- Lam, S. F., Wong, B. P., Yang, H., & Liu, Y. (2021). Understanding and measuring quality and quality education: A review study. *Review of Educational Research*, 91(2), 242-275.
- Liu, H. (2018). On the realistic needs of education ecology under quality education. *Contemporary Education Science*, (1), 42-44.

- Mahmoudi, S., Jafari, E., Nasrabadi, H. A., & Liaghatdar, M. J. (2012). Holistic education: An approach for 21 century. *International Education Studies*, 5(2), 178-186.
- Margalit, A., & Raz, J. (2022). National self-determination. In *Group Rights* (pp. 445-467). Routledge.
- Mehrotra, M. A. (2017). Holistic Education Necessary for Harmonizing Human Consciousness and Economic Development. *Innovation, Inspiration, and Hope in a VUCA*, 13, 106-115.
- Mikkonen, T., Lassenius, C., Männistö, T., Oivo, M., & Järvinen, J. (2018). Continuous and collaborative technology transfer: Software engineering research with real-time industry impact. *Information & Software Technology*, 95, 34–45. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.infsof.2017.10.013>
- Miller, J. P. (2007). *The holistic curriculum*. University of Toronto Press.
- Miller, J. P. (2007). *The holistic curriculum*. University of Toronto Press.
- Miller, R. (2000). Caring for new life: Essays on holistic education. *The Encounter: Education for Meaning and Social Justice*, 13(3), 50-54.
- Nava, R. G. (2001). *Holistic education: Pedagogy of universal love*. Foundation for Educational Renewal.
- Nordquist, R. (2021, August 26). *Contrastive analysis in linguistics*. ThoughtCo. <https://www.thoughtco.com/contrastive-analysis-linguistics-1689858>
- Nussbaum, M. C. (2016). *Not for profit: Why democracy needs the humanities*. Princeton university press.
- Rhoten, D., Boix Mansilla, V., Chun, M., & Klein, J. T. (2006). Interdisciplinary education at liberal arts institutions. *Teagle Foundation white paper*, 13, 2007.
- Roche, M. W. (2010). *Why choose the liberal arts?*. University of Notre Dame Press.
- Roche, M. W. (2013). The landscape of the liberal arts. *New Directions for Community Colleges*, 2013(163), 3–10. <https://doi.org/10.1002/cc.20065>
- Roth, M. S. (2015). Beyond the university: why liberal education matters. *Choice Reviews Online*, 52(06), 52–3365. <https://doi.org/10.5860/choice.186529>
- Stebbins, R. A. (2017). *Between work and leisure: The common ground of two separate worlds*. Routledge.
- Tam, W. M. (2009). A study on the quality of education in Hong Kong. *Hong Kong Teachers' Centre Journal*, 8, 104-120.
- Thomas, D. C., & Inkson, K. C. (2017). *Cultural intelligence: Surviving and thriving in the global village*. Berrett-Koehler Publishers.
- Wang, J.H. (2017). On the Relationship between General Education and Professional Education. *Journal of Marxism Studies* (02), 28-34. doi:CNKI:SUN:MKSK.0.2017-02-004.
- Wang, L. (2007). *The Concept of Holistic Education and Its Implications for Quality Education in Chinese Universities*. Shaanxi Education (Higher Education Edition), (07), 105. doi:10.16773/j.cnki.1002-2058.2007.07.084.
- Wei, H.X. (2018). To Cultivate Overall-development Students: The Aim of General Education and Professional Education of Universities. *Journal of Tongren University* (04), 59-60. doi:CNKI:SUN:TRSF.0.2018-04-014.
- Wheeler, L. (2015). Not just skills: What a focus on knowledge means for vocational education. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 47(6), 750-762.

- Zakaria, F. (2015). *In defense of a liberal education*. <https://www.amazon.com/Defense-Liberal-Education-Fareed-Zakaria/dp/039335234X>
- Zhang, G. (2022). On the historical evolution and practical significance of quality education. *Journal of Hebei Normal University (Educational Science Edition)*, 24(3), 23-28.
- Zhang, J.J. (2017). Preliminary exploration on the planning of topics for university humanities general education textbooks. *Literature Education (Part 1)* (09), 108-109. doi:10.16692/j.cnki.wxjys.2017.09.055.
- Zhao, Y. (2022). Quality education: lessons from China. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 54(1), 1-18.